

Pacific ADA Center

**“ADA NATIONAL NETWORK LEARNING SESSION: WHAT LARGE-
SCALE PLANNED EVENTS CAN TEACH US ABOUT INCLUSIVE
PLANNING FOR DISASTERS:**

**LESSONS LEARNED FROM THE 2014 WORLD SERIES
CHAMPIONSHIP PARADE & CIVIC CELEBRATION IN SAN
FRANCISCO”**

Carla Johnson & Joanna Fraguli

Thursday, February 12, 2015

Communication Access Real-time Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

This transcript is being provided in rough-draft format.

CART Services Provided by:
Home Team Captions
<http://www.hometeamcaptions.com/>

>> Lewis Kraus: Welcome to the Emergency Management and Preparedness - Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities webinar series. I'm Lewis Kraus from the Pacific ADA Center, your moderator. This series of webinars is brought to you by the Pacific ADA Center as a collaborate effort between the FEMA Office of Disability Integration and Coordination or ODIC.

The ADA National Network is made up of 10 regional centers federally funded to provide training, technical assistance and other information as needed on the Americans with Disabilities Act. You can reach your regional ADA Center by dialing 1-800-949-4232. And I have posted that in the chat window.

FEMA's ODIC covers the same 10 regions with regional disability integration specialists. For more information about FEMA, www.fema.gov then type in ODIC into the FEMA website search.

This webinar series will share issues and promising practices and emergency management inclusive of people with disabilities and others with access and functional needs. The webinars provide an opportunity for emergency managers, people with disabilities, and others with access and functional needs, first responders, planners, community organizations, and other community partners to exchange knowledge and information on promising practices in inclusive emergency preparedness and management for the whole community.

This year's topics will cover emergency management and preparedness and disaster response, recovery, as well as accessibility and responsible accommodation issues under the Rehabilitation Act of 1973, the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990, the ADA, and other relevant laws. The series will alternate monthly between ADA National Network learning sessions, and FEMA Promising Practices.

We encourage you review the series website and familiarize yourself with the full array of sessions available in the series at <http://www.adapresentations.org/schedule.php>. These monthly webinars occur on the second Thursday of the month at 2:30 Eastern, 1:30 Central, 12:30 Mountain, and 11:30 Pacific time. By being here you are on the list to receive notices for future webinars in this series. The notices go out two to three weeks before the next webinar and open that webinar to registration.

For those of you who are new to the webinar series and its software, we will now review some of the features of the webinar platform before we begin today's session.

In this session only the speakers will have audio. The audio for today's webinar is being broadcast through your computer. Make sure your speakers are turned on or your headphones are plugged in. You can adjust the sound by sliding the sound bar left or right in the audio and video panel which is in the upper left-hand corner of your screen. If you are having sound quality problems go through the audio wizard which is accessed by selecting that microphone icon with the red gear on it in that audio and video panel.

If you do not have sound capabilities on your computer or have to listen by phone, you can dial 1-805-309-2350 and the pass code there is 555-2153. That number is not a toll-free number but there are local numbers that can be found which should be toll-free for you on our website at http://www.adapresentations.org/local_numbers.php that link is on the screen.

The webinar is being recorded and can be accessed on the <http://www.adapresentations.org/archives.php> website within 72 hours of the conclusion of the session.

You can follow along with the webinar platform with the slides. If you're not using the webinar platform, you can download a copy of today's PowerPoint presentation at the <http://www.adapresentations.org/schedule.php> web page.

The session is being captioned. Realtime captioning is provided. You can access the caption screen by choosing the CC icon in the audio and video panel up in the top. The box showing the captions can be resized to show more or less text as you would like.

Similarly, you can customize your screen, your view of the white board, where these presentation slides are shown by resizing smaller or larger. There's a dropdown menu located above and to the left of the white board. And on it says "fit page." And that's the default. You can change the size if you would like.

Similarly, you can reposition the chat window, the participant window, the captioning window, and audio/video panel business detaching and using your mouse to reposition or stretch or shrink. And you can detach by using that icon which has several lines and a little arrow in it in the upper right corner of each panel.

At the conclusion of today's presentation there will be an opportunity for everyone to ask questions. You may submit your questions using the chat area within the webinar platform. And the speakers and I will address them at the end of the session. So feel free to submit them as they come to your mind during the presentation.

If you are listening by phone and not logged into the webinar, you may ask questions by e-mailing them to adatech@adapacific.org.

Also, I should mention if you are using key strokes to get to the chat text box windows, press Control M and enter text in the chat window.

If you experience technical difficulties during the webinar, you can send a private chat message to me by double clicking on my name or on Pacific ADA Center in the participant list. The tab titled Pacific ADA Center will appear. Type in your comment in the text box and enter or keyboard F6 and arrow up or down to locate Pacific ADA Center and select to send a message. You can also e-mail to adatech@adapacific.org or call us at 510-218-5600.

So, spring is in the air in some parts of the country. Pitchers and catchers report to baseball spring training shortly. Coincidentally, today's ADA National Network Learning Session is titled "What Large-Scale Planned Events Can Teach Us About Inclusive Planning for Disasters: Learned From the 2014 World Series Championship Parade & Civic Celebration in San Francisco."

We often think of disaster planning in terms of a big fire, earthquake, tornado, or terrorist attack. However, many large-scale, planned public events require similar emergency planning and coordination with police, fire, transportation, and public information officers and the ability to react with creative and flexible approaches to problem solve.

Using the 2014 San Francisco Giants' championship parade and civic celebration as a case study, this session will examine the necessary steps in preplanning to ensure the inclusion and safety of people with disabilities and seniors, will review public information dissemination and other strategies to ensure effective communication before and during a large-scale event and draw the common themes between large-scale events and disasters and use them as an opportunity to practice disaster response.

Our speakers today are Carla Johnson and Joanna Fraguli from the San Francisco Mayor's Office on Disability. Carla Johnson is the Director of the San Francisco Mayor's Office on Disability which is the city's ADA compliance program. She joined the office in 2008 to serve as an emergency planner focused on disability integration. Before that she spent 15 years at the Department of Building Inspection where she was the incident commander for the Department of Building Inspection's emergency response at landslides, rockslides, building collapses and other emergencies.

Joanna Fraguli is the Deputy Director for Programmatic Access at the San Francisco Mayor's Office on Disability where she has been overseeing programmatic access compliance for city and county programs since July of 2006. She has been working to bring disability issues to the forefront of emergency management efforts by facilitating public and private sector collaboration projects, providing specialized training for American Red Cross leadership and their volunteers, and writing specific policy statements about disability issues in city and county of San Francisco's emergency response plan.

So, Carla and Joanna, you can take it away.

>> Carla Johnson: Thank you for that introduction. I'm Carla Johnson. I'm here with our Deputy Director from the Mayor's Office on Disability, Joanna Fraguli. As Lewis mentioned, our Office of San Francisco's overall ADA coordinator and we're tasked with making sure that our city programs, services, and facilities are accessible as required under the ADA. We consider disaster planning to be just another program that has an ADA piece. Because of that our office is deeply involved in the city's disaster planning and response efforts. Our role is to make sure that the planning is inclusive and that it addresses the needs of people with

disabilities.

Today what Joanna and I are going to talk about are large-scale planned events and what they can teach us about inclusive planning for disasters. The reason why we're using one of these large events is our laboratory is that large events really aren't all that different from how we plan for disasters. Both of them use the Incident Command System, or ICS, both have multiple departments or stakeholders that are involved, both need disability expertise to run smoothly. And in many ways a planned event is just a practice for a disaster.

We're going to be using the Giants' World Series championship parade and civic celebrations as our case study and we're actually going to be talking about three different parades: 2010, 2012, and 2014. Our presentation will describe some of the issues and problems that surfaced in 2010 when our office was not involved in the planning and all of these are issues that could be present after a disaster. Then we will talk about the planning process in 2012 and 2014 when our office was very deeply involved.

Finally, we'll have a conversation about how even with the best of plans in disability involvements, things can still go wrong and it's very important to be flexible and creative but most importantly to be present to solve problems as that he rise.

You might very well ask: What's the connection between a large planned event and a disaster? And the answer is that both of them affect a large number of people. And because of that there are multiple city departments who are going to be playing a role. This requires an all-hands-on-deck coordination. The fire department, emergency medical support and transportation systems need to know about street closures and crowd estimates. And police are going to be responsible for security and public safety. The public information officers need to distribute information about the event so people can plan how they'll get there and how long they'll stay.

Planning for people with disabilities -- has to be embedded in every single piece of the operation because we know from experience that if we don't talk about it, if we don't ask the pointed questions, if we make assumptions, then we can bet something is going to go wrong.

And if we don't plan properly, then at the very least, people with disabilities won't have the opportunity to participant. They'll be excluded. And discrimination is discrimination whether it's intentional neglect or an accidental oversight.

At the other end of the spectrum, people with disabilities could actually be harmed if we don't plan for this. And that's why people with disabilities need to be a part of any plan, whether it is for an event or after a disaster.

This slide on the screen is showing a crowd of people on the ground. Thousands of people have gathered in one spot. And the aerial shot is a shot that was taken in Haiti after

their devastating earthquake. In Haiti, 1.5 million people were displaced and left without housing or shelter. And this is a natural disaster. Haiti lacked the planning and infrastructure to support that many people. And, frankly, any city or state would be challenged to meet the needs of a crowd this size even with the best of disaster plans. That's part of the reason why we have to ask individuals to at least take some personal responsibility for their own needs, to anticipate their need for water, for food, for medications, appropriate clothing and more. But then, of course, if they're unable to do that, then that's where the government needs to step in.

This next slide shows an aerial view of Civic Center Plaza during the 2010 Giants celebration. The label might say 2014 but actually it was from 2010. These two pictures of Haiti and Civic Center Plaza look remarkably similar. At each of the three celebrations in 2010, 2012, and 2014, there were as many as one million people who showed up either along the parade route on Market Street or at the celebration in Civic Center Plaza where a big stage was set up on the steps of City Hall.

Now, if you use the census data figures and you estimate that 20% of the crowd has some level or type of disability, then you can estimate that 200,000 people who were there that day had a disability. And that's why we need a seat at the table when plans are being developed. We can't assume that the planners have us covered.

So what do one million people need? If we're talking about a one-day event where we can take housing or shelter out of the conversation, then at a minimum we need water. We need water to maintain our health and to sustain our life. And we need toilets for sanitation health and disease prevention. We need emergency medical support, whether that's basic first aid, paramedic services for emergencies, or ambulances if somebody needs to be transported to a hospital. And we need an accessible path to travel. And when we talk about an accessible path to travel that includes transportation systems such as MUNI, BART, and paratransit but it also includes the sidewalks and curb cuts and clear, unobstructed paths that we use to navigate through a crowd. And it includes the ramp that lead us into buildings and up on to platforms. But last of all, one million people and the police, fire, and emergency personnel who serve them need to have disability awareness and the flexibility to make reasonable modifications to any plan, policy, or service if it's not accommodate a person with a disability.

Drinking water. The celebration in 2010 was on this clear and beautiful day and people started arriving on Market Street and in the plaza at 7:00 a.m. The parade started around 10:30 a.m. but the celebration in Civic Center Plaza didn't start until afternoon. That means that there were people standing around for five to seven hours on a day where the temperature reached 90 degrees. If you've ever been in a large crowd, the air doesn't move or circulate very well. In some places it is even hotter.

When it came to water, each person was on their own because the city hadn't planned to provide the water. The local stores along the parade route had trouble keeping up

with demand from all of those people trying to buy the water. The people who were in the plaza, didn't even have a way to get to a store. If they left their seat in the plaza, they lost their space and there was no clear path to get in and out of the plaza.

The first -- on the perimeter that day met with many cases of heat stress and dehydration. Nowadays, when Joanna and I work with the Department of Emergency Management, water delivery after a disaster is one of the first things we discuss as a group. And the city's Public Utility Commission is the agency that delivers clean water to our homes and businesses. After our experience in 2010, the PUC now stages water trucks at these large events so that people can refill their personal bottles or drink from the cups that are provided. And this is part of the PUC's plan to support shelter operations and points of distribution after a disaster, too.

After water, sanitation becomes one of the fundamental basic needs anytime people gather. And this slide shows a picture of an accessible portable toilet.

In 2010 the Giants' celebration happened very fast, within about 48 hours of the last game. And our office wasn't involved in planning the 2010 event. And frankly, I don't think we even understood how all the moving parts would fit together or how big it was really going to get. But on that morning in 2010 Joanna and I walked out to the plaza, because we wanted to see for ourselves how it had been set up. We had a lot of confidence because, you know, years back our office had created an accessible public meeting and event policy. And the policy provides guidance to all of the city event planners. It covers everything from choosing a site that's accessible to choosing a site that has accessible toilets. So we thought the toilet issue was going to be covered because when portable toilets are used for everybody, at least 5% in each cluster, preferably 10%, should be accessible portable toilets.

But what Joanna and I found when we walked out that day was that none of the portable toilets were accessible. There had been a mix-up with the vendor and they didn't deliver the right units. And this was a huge problem. Because by the time we got out there at 10:00 a.m., the plaza was already filling up and there was no way to call the vendor and have them bring trucks in to bring more.

So while Joanna and I were talking about this problem, we were approached by a woman who uses a wheelchair. She had gotten off the BART train around 7:00 after a really long ride and had already tried to use restrooms along Market Street by going into restaurants but no one would let her use the facilities, which means that by the time she saw us she was actually pretty desperate for a restroom and she was asking us for some help to help her find an accessible one.

So we know Civic Center pretty well and we know that we have a lot of accessible public buildings that have accessible restrooms. So we agreed to take this woman with us to the public library, which is a building that's on the perimeter of the plaza. But by this time the

crowd was already getting really congested. As we walked through the plaza, we had to keep saying, "Excuse me. Excuse me" to get people to move out of our way. It took a really long time to get the crowd to move. But finally we got to the library.

So our takeaway here is having separate facilities, using portable toilets for able-bodied folks and a very long walk to the perimeter to find accessible facilities for people with disabilities is not equal treatment. And this conversation comes up frequently when I talk to our emergency shelter folks. When we look at shelter sites to decide which ones are the best ones, we need to have accessible toilets inside the building.

Either everyone's going to use the accessible facilities inside building or everyone is going to use portable toilet facilities outside the building but we don't want to set things up so that people with disabilities are treated differently. Because we know that separate but equal is found to be discrimination.

At this point I want to go ahead and transition to Joanna Fraguli.

>> Joanna Fraguli: Good morning or good afternoon, everyone, depending on where you are in the country. The next slide we're going to talk about is really about emergency medical support and really access for ambulances, etc.

Carla already shared with you the experience with the wheelchair user who was pretty desperate trying to find a restroom. And as a wheelchair user myself, we found it extremely difficult getting through the crowd actually in a very celebratory mode, because sometimes everybody was trying to get somewhere, was having a difficult time being courteous.

So the high density of people within a concentrated area that's relatively small creates a number of issues for everyone to begin with but more specifically for people with mobility disabilities, smaller stature, wheelchair users, or accessibility device users.

People can lose their balance. They can be overheated and faint or pass out. And unfortunately those situations, medical help or EMS assistants cannot come right on the spot.

So one of the lessons we learned from that 2010 celebration experience was the lack of access for EMS vehicles became of paramount importance. Emergency vehicles were not the only ones, of course. I'm going to give you another example. In the example of the wheelchair user we sort of managed to get her in the library which normally in a less crowded situation takes approximately three minutes to navigate from where she was. At that pointed it taken us about 15 minutes. So let me provide with you another example.

This is a person with a chronic health condition. He had gotten there early. I should preface by saying his health condition was very well managed with a special medication regiment. This individual had known about the long day he was going to have at the parade. He had come early and was able to secure a seat, a specially designated sitting area for

people with disabilities. No problems getting there. No problems getting seated. However, he had to use the restroom. And once again that restroom, especially the wheelchair, accessible one, was further from the sitting area that he was in. So due to the crowd he was unable to return to the designated sitting area where the medication was left.

Fortunately a smaller, younger family member was able to -- essentially a minor -- was able to kind of duck through the crowds and get to the sitting area, reach the medication and come back to him. However, this could have the potential of being an almost fatal medical emergency.

So that leaves us to the accessible. Accessible can mean so many more things here. We, of course, are more familiar with the concept of the ADA compliance is accessible route, where you can access accessible features with an accessible path. But it's also important to talk about just a clear path period for large events, including disasters, for a quick navigation through a crowded area. So let's talk a little bit about that accessible access route, what it should look like.

Elements of accessible travel should have the wide enough route, free from obstructions, and that's important, like steps or street furniture but also debris, loose cables, etc. Sometimes after an earthquake, after a flood, there is tons of stuff. And even with the best of intentions, we can designate a quick-moving area but if you are having pedestrians, people with disabilities, children, seniors, etc., they will be impeded by that presumably wide, inaccessible route.

Now, direct access to your wide, obstruction-free route, needs to connect you to accessible street crossings. You also need to be connected to a curb ramp, permanent or temporary, accessible portable toilets, water stations, first aid stations, etc.

As we move through the presentations, you are going to see a site plan which Carla will walk you through. But you will get to understand, and she will point out at that point what the access routes for both people with disabilities and EMS, Emergency Medical Services, was like.

Now, we preface this seminar by saying that we have the experience of three years of those large planned events, 2010, 2012, and 2014. In 2010 we were not involved at all. We only received the information after the event, after the event was planned. However, in 2012, we were able to do a little bit more. And we were actually assigned or stationed there as helping and concierge, ambassadors of the day's event.

And one of the things that we experienced is that barricades had blocked the access of curb ramps. So even if you could get through, if you were a wheelchair user, had difficulty navigating curbs, you could actually not get to the area you were trying to get to, which was a big oversight. Sometimes we were able to deal with it in time but you can imagine if you have a designated route and you have a huge crowd around it becomes very challenging to make

just-in-time adjustments.

So finally, the third point I want to talk about in the accessible path of travel is the importance of providing directions. Imagine a crowded situation where you can't really see clearly, where everything is, especially if you are, again, traveling from a lower advantage point.

So directional signage that leads you to a specific area or points to a specific area needs to be available not only to be available but to also be visible in a high enough area that it's unobstructed and also provides a quick reminder to all the public safety officers and security personnel who are trying to direct traffic.

We, again, one of the experiences we had learned from the 2012 event was that even though there were accessible features during the Civic Center celebration, a lot of our personnel didn't know about it and they were not able to direct the crowd or public that needed them easily and quickly. So prior communication is key along with a clear directional advantage visible for everyone, whether they need the signs or not.

I think we need to go one back. Ok.

This is the disability awareness and reasonable modifications to policies, practice and procedures. It's the pinnacle of community planning. Oftentimes the community at large, public safety officers or emergency managers could bring their perceptions of what people with disabilities look like. Most of us think of people with disabilities in terms of wheelchair users, restricted mobility, people who have something visible, people who are blind or deaf. But this leaves out the notion, leaves out a very large number of people with invisible disabilities. And they most commonly include people with chronic health conditions, with cognitive disabilities, all situations that can be exacerbated in an emergency or in a crowded -- any type of crowded situation.

Still, let's talk about -- I'm going to bring you back to the gentleman who was unable to return to his seat. Because of his medication. He was separated from his medication. The other interesting part of the story that speaks to that issue of disability awareness is that he approached, as he was trying to get through the crowd, he was approached -- he approached several officers, public safety officers, and asked for assistance. He identified himself as a person with a disability. He said that he was trying to get back to his seat at the accessible section and could they please help him get there. The officers were overwhelmed. They took one look at him and said, you know, you're just trying to get to the accessible seating and that's already filled up. You can't get there.

Thankfully, as I said, his minor, under-aged, companion was able to duck the crowds and able to get the help she needed. But even when the disability was visible, there were experiences of personnel not understanding or any kind of security guard in the area not understanding the concept of a reasonable modification to the standard operating procedure in

order to provide access.

So once again, first we had an individual with an invisible disability. And in this case example we had an electric wheelchair user. She was forced to make a huge detour due to street closures and ended up running out of battery power when she specifically approached staff asking for permission to go through a more direct, barricaded area that was accessible.

Similarly, getting through the crowd was very challenging in 2010 because there were not designated clear paths for crowd movement. Some of the more accessible paths were actually designated as VIP-only areas. And people with disabilities were not allowed to go through those areas even if it was with security escorts.

So accessibility expertise in the planning process meant that public safety officers did not get any reminders about the type of disabilities present that might present in the crowd. And they also were not reminded or empowered with the choice to make reasonable modifications or even resources to problem solve.

So once again, those little cases, examples of previous omissions, are a good reason of why we need a seat at the table early on. Disability expertise matters in any event that has a massive impact, whether it's an earthquake, flood, terrorist event, or an exciting event like a championship celebration.

Getting involved in these types of conversations can be challenging and requires a lot of persistence. During the 2010 event we were made aware of challenges experienced by people with disabilities, ourselves included. And we were able to demonstrate after the fact to the planners of the resources that were to provide ahead of time to assist with the smoother operation. In 2012, our involvement got increasingly higher. In 2012, we were able to actually have staff on the ground assisting with just-in-time information, resources, and help. By 2014, MOD was considered one of the key players and received the same information as everyone else at the same time.

So I just want to clarify that this was not a special meeting that MOD had with the emergency managers but we were included in the entire meeting at the emergency operation centers where we received the same information as everyone else. And that helped because we were actually able to get an understanding of the bigger operational picture. That's had a couple of different benefits. It's a big deal, really.

First of all, we were able to communicate with everyone involved in making decisions from the very beginning. That means that we were able to provide those reminders, we were able to look at the site plan and comment on just in time. We were able to ask the pointed questions such as have you booked [Indiscernible]. How do we work with the captioning? Are we making sure that the big projection screens have open captioning on them?

Now, the second part, which was also really important, perhaps most important, is for our office to be able to understand the event, to understand the extent of what was anticipated, and to be able to communicate that through our network to the general public of people with disabilities. This was really, really important because it allows us to manage expectations for the public and to do a little bit of what we talked about taking charge of your personal preparedness for people with disabilities.

So I'm going to talk first about the first benefit of getting the operational picture, the areas of where we focus in 2014, the areas where we focus disability access. First, it was crowd control. The ease of movement between -- among the crowds. It was about providing public information and signage, both during the event or throughout the event space and also before the event to people with disabilities; creating the accessible viewing platforms and seating; creating, ensuring accessible portable toilets and path of travel connecting directly to them. It was about transportation planning and reroutes and getting the information out; communication access which we'll go over in more detail; providing equal effective communication to everyone who was participating at the event. And finally, putting those disability expertise in the field of operations, in the form of having ADA ambassadors that were visible to provide assistance and information and just-in-time information to people with disabilities and actually the staff.

So let's talk for a minute about communication and public information. Because our office has the word disability in its title, we often get public inquiries from the public about access to any event happening in the city whether we are involved in it or not. So imagine if you were in San Jose, for example, coming to a big regional event in San Francisco and you were looking for information as a person with a disability. You would look for a listing of something that has to do with disability services to ask for the most up-to-date information.

Still, we already have that sort of credibility and we are challenged with that responsibility. So we capitalize on it to be able to manage public expectations. So we disseminated information through a website and e-mail blasts to partner agencies regarding access features but also the limited amount of space and realistic challenges.

For example, we issued tips for people with disabilities watching the parade. We asked people to check on our website often. We included tips like: limited wheelchair accessible seating on a first come, first serve basis; where that accessible entrance was located; the fact that ASL interpretation was going to be present; where the ASL interpreter was going to be located; reminder about food, water, medications, etc. We provided advisors like trying to strongly encourage people to not bring service or support animals in the celebration due to the excessive crowds; posted reroutes and public transportation advisories. We also mentioned the fact that there were going to be individuals clearly marked as ADA ambassadors to be able to assist folks whenever needed if able to locate them.

Our office was also instrumental in making sure that there was clear signage provided throughout the site to be able to facilitate a smoother flow of communication for the public. So we would make sure, for example, that ADA language was included in the signs, the general signs, that were directing the public, thousands of people, to different areas of the celebration route. ADA language -- there was ADA language present but unfortunately not a grassroots representation like international of accessibility. It would just simply say VIP entrance, ADA access, or something like that.

Now, communication access -- I'm sorry. We're going to go to the site plan now so you can get a visual.

>> **Carla Johnson:** This is Carla again. Joanna described the planning meetings at the Emergency Operation Center. And building on our experience of 2010, by 2012 and 2014, the event planners provided our office with a proposed layout of the Civic Center celebration. And it gave us a chance to review and to comment on that layout.

What this slide shows is a plan view or an aerial view, if you like, of the entire Civic Center Plaza area. It's pictured are the blocks by Van Ness on the west, Larkin on the east, Hayes on the south and Golden Gate on the north. And this big picture view of the eight city blocks provides the context for anticipated street closures, the placement of the stage, location for the portable toilets, barricades staking out both the emergency egress and the accessible path of travel, first aid stations, water trucks, and distribution points.

Having the plan in advance gave us the opportunity to physically walk the site the day before the event and provide early notice when we found that things were missing while we could still actually make adjustments. For example, this plan showed accessible portable toilets in multiple locations and unobstructed curb ramps of the corners. But when I showed up on the site and had the plan in hand, I was able to point out to the event planners the areas where the accessible units hadn't arrived yet and corners where the curbs were blocked by barricades.

This next slide is an enlarged view of the previous plan. It showed the key functional areas, all of which were accessible. The top left, Van Ness and Grove, there was a controlled entry point. This gate allowed entry to the very important people, the VIPs, and also people with disabilities. That entry point provided the shortest and most direct route from the drop-off zone such as the white loading zones on Van Ness and there by the seating areas.

Because we knew in advance, we were able to broadcast that information and the communication that Joanna mentioned just earlier. There were barricades that surrounded City Hall but those barricades didn't interfere with our curb ramps or a path of travel. And this again, was the lesson that we learned from 2012, the first time that we saw barricades.

The VIP seating was on folding chairs on Polk Street in front of the stage which faced the entrance of City Hall. And the accessible seating area was just behind the VIP area on an

elevated platform. And that accessible seating area provided actually some of the best seats in the plaza.

We also had some very important people who were people with mobility disabilities, and we had to do a little bit of on-the-spot training for the security staff because they kept trying to direct those individuals to our accessible public seating area. We had to tell security, no, they're VIP; they can choose where they want to sit. They can sit with all the other VIPs or they can sit on the platform. It's their choice.

The accessible seating area also had a clear and unobstructed path of travel. Again, this is one of those lessons learned from 2010. So people were able to come and go wherever they wanted to or they needed to. And the accessible seating area also had their very own portable toilets.

There were four LED TV screens that would broadcast what was happening on both on the parade route as well as the plaza celebration. And they had realtime captioning enabled on those screens.

And also pictured in the slide are the egress aisles in the larger plaza. And these aisles were the ones used by police for security, by EMS to treat medical emergencies, and move people out when that was needed, and for event staff to navigate as runners when they had to communicate. And then, of course, most importantly from our perspective, maintaining an accessible path of travel for people with disabilities.

The physical setup of the Civic Center Plaza affects the circulation route. What we had learned in 2010 was that an uncontrolled crowd won't allow people with disabilities or Emergency Medical Services to get through.

We told you a little earlier about trying to get through the plaza with a woman who was a wheelchair user. At the beginning of our travel through the plaza, people were pretty nice. We would say, "Excuse me," but as everybody crammed closer and closer together, the crowd can get a little ugly; especially if it doesn't have, you know, room to back up, to let you pass. That's why in 2012 and 2014 our layout included those barricades. They created the unobstructed path to the accessible seating, and just as importantly, the barricades divided the plaza itself into quadrants so the emergency personnel could get there.

The barricades which were such a great thing getting rolled out in 2012 actually blocked some of our curb ramps. That meant that on-the-spot we had to be calling for just-in-time portable ramps to bridge the sidewalk. By 2014 we had the layout perfected so that we could use the curb ramp infrastructure that we had that just became part of the path of travel. There didn't need to be any additional ramps for those.

One other issue that comes up, again, that you find out in the field, is that the accessible path from Grove Street passed by television trucks. And these trucks needed

power. So there were cables that were running to generators. And in some cases these cables had to be run into City Hall and they were going across our sidewalk, our accessible path of travel. So now we had to find accessible cable trays to bridge the cables. The event planner had brought some cable trays that were designed more for ambulatory folks just to prevent them from tripping over something on the ground but what we needed were the accessible units that could be used by people in wheelchairs.

The event planner was able to find them in realtime, but the lesson is that we should be specing to ask for more because we're always going to need more temporary access ramps than originally planned for. Again, that's something I think we'll see with our shelter operations as well. You always need more of that just-in-time access.

The physical setup also had an elevated viewing platform for people with disabilities. This provided great seats but the path of travel to get up to the platform relied upon a mobile lift like the one pictured on this slide.

Back in 2012 we specified that the event planner needed to give us two mobile lifts. One would be there as a backup in case the first one failed. And, of course, as predictable, true and form, the first lift failed and had a mechanical failure. So we had to bring in the second lift just to be able to get folks down from the platform at the end of the afternoon. So that lesson that we learned was that we always have to have a backup.

Moving forward to 2014, though, even though we had asked for a backup, the vendor only delivered one. So on the morning of the event at 6:30, we're having spirited conversations in the street demanding a backup, demanding that they deliver one immediately. And that wasn't possible. So the compromise, the creativity, really, was to have the vendor lift mechanic close by to be able to deal with any problems.

We got their commitment to fix them as they come up. And sure enough, all day long we had power problems because of the rain, because of the voltage drop, because of the length of the power cord. And every time we had that problem, we had that lift mechanic there to deal with it in realtime but it took constant vigilance where our staff had to actually staff that lift from beginning to end. This is part of the reason why when we choose our potential emergency shelter sites, our office is very clear that we want locations that don't rely on elevators or lifts to get into the shelter because we know that power outages after a disaster are predictable. So we want to be able to be flexible.

Last of all, in the accessible seating area, what we learned from 2010 and 2012 was that you really need to have those accessible portable toilets close. They should be right adjacent to the seating area. That way people don't need to leave and they don't need to risk getting caught in a crowd.

With that back to Joanna.

>> **Joanna Fraguli:** As we pass the speaker phone back and forth, I'm going to talk a little bit now about -- [Indiscernible]. We talked about communication with the public as well as with event staff ahead of time. But what during the event?

Part of our involvement on the planning table included also reminders about communication access. Sign language interpretation was something that our event planners were ahead of time aware of. And they could actually schedule the interpreters before we even knew that the Giants were going to win the World Series. Now, captioning or realtime captioning, was a different story.

Our event planner was not particularly familiar with that. Trying to book a realtime captioner 48 hours before an event is almost impossible. So we creatively problem solved and worked with a remote captioning provider who was able to include -- to give us the feed so that it would be included in the televised section of the events happening throughout the plaza.

However, as we all know, it's the nature of emergencies, including planned events, that things do not always work out according to plan. Although we advocated for the ASL interpreters to be positioned on the stage, right next to the speakers therefore including the televised feed, those projected throughout the plaza, they were not successful. At the last minute they were stationed in a separate area along with the designated public spectator section but the visibility was not clear. The people who were deaf could not clearly see the interpreters. And that's where our interpreters took the situation on their hands. They found an elevated area that they could be positioned in. They worked it out with the crowd that was relying on them for communication. And they were also away from the screen shot. They worked with some of the TV crews.

So the main takeaway here is to be alert, to think quickly and creative, and do the best you can with the resources you have available of the because oftentimes the best plans cannot be executed are for reasons beyond our control. But our best resources is the people who are able to think on their feet and problem solve.

And speaking of people who are able to creatively problem solve, that brings us to our Disability Access Ambassadors. We relied on that resource of disability savvy individuals to form a Disability Access Ambassador team, part of which is pictured on this slide.

We learned from our experience in 2010, just because I'm a wheelchair user, I was immediately approached by another wheelchair user for information. So it was really important that we also had individuals with visible disabilities as part of the team to make ourselves more visible, we wore bright yellow vests, clearly marked with an ADA/ISA symbol on the back. You can't see the back on that picture. But we also had big poles, like broomsticks with a big ISA that was easily mounted to the back of a wheelchair and therefore visible in a large crowd or was carried by the folks who were ambulatory.

Now, it's very important to state that the access ambassadors were not just

volunteers through some concierge here and there. They were actually people who have deep knowledge about disability access and are able to provide just-in-time technical assistance whether it's physical access issues or programmatic steps. All of us had backstage access passes so we were the same as the rest of the event staff, production staff. I had a sign -- Carla mentioned, 6:30 in the morning, we made a point of positioning ourselves in key areas, key entry points, and introducing ourselves to everybody else on the team to security personnel, safety, public safety officers.

So this team was also empowered to interface and to actually make recommendations and make judgment calls and be there as a resource for everybody else who had questions. We were not brought in until after the fact. And it was not just our -- our involvement was not just theoretical at the EOC, but really each one of us having a pre-designated post and function.

Now, as always happens, Carla talked about the first parade which was 2010, really hot weather. Now in 2014 we had exactly the opposite, rainy weather. And once again the wheelchair lift did not work properly. We had tons of delays getting people on and off the accessible seating areas. Power failure and exposure to water made it less reliable. Despite weather advisories for the public, large crowds, including people with disabilities, still started showing up to the event. Most of them not realizing how really the cold and rainy weather was going to affect them.

Our access ambassadors were there at the thick of it because they were able to run back and forth and advocate and get some limited supply of ponchos we had or towels to assist people affected by the cold. Of course, the rainy weather, and we talked about the cable trays and accessible cable trays. The rainy weather -- and actually it was quite a downpour, made the pavement extremely slick. And those cable trays became extremely slippery. So it was much harder to navigate for people with mobility disabilities, people with walkers, seniors, etc. Our access ambassadors once again came to the rescue helping folks navigate with sometimes literally hands-on assistance in getting people through the crowd and the accessible paths.

>> Carla Johnson: What have we learned? We learned we need to get the full picture. And even if the material is covered in a plan, we can't assume everyone has read the plan or even that everything in the plan has been completed. This requires vigilance on our part because with the plan in hand we still need to walk the site to confirm that the features are present.

>> Joanna Fraguli: Building relationships with the key players matters. We would like to suggest that you approach situations by offering resources and assistance up front rather than pointing out the oversights after the fact. It makes you a lot more friends this way.

It's important to learn also how to speak the same language. Disability experts have to learn the event/emergency planner jargon. And similarly, we need to teach our emergency

planners, event staff, disability jargon and disability-related concepts.

>> Carla Johnson: And this is what we would do after a disaster. We would visit the shelters and we would evaluate whether or not people's needs are being met and we would meet with the residents and the staff. And then we have to be able to function with power and technology breakdowns because if the cell phones and radios don't work, we have to go back to the old-school runners.

Finally, what we've learned about both planned events and disasters events is that people with disabilities have to be part of the plan. And planning isn't enough. We need disability experts in the field to verify and problem solve. Keeping it simple is always the best advice. Making the accessible route everyone's route. Don't rely on mechanical devices to break down. Expect that you're going to be surprised. And don't have a meltdown in the moment because of that surprise. You need to maintain your flexibility and creativity to help you solve your problems in the moments.

As you heard Joanna mention, relationships really matter whether that's with the partner agencies like police and fire and PUC or even just a carpenter and electrician out in the site. If you have a relationship in advance and you have the credibility, they will help.

Finally, a few final thoughts. One person cannot do it all. If an office similar to MOD is not available in your area, form partnerships with other local disability experts, your local IOCs, local organizations serving people with disabilities would be happy to be part of your event and your field operations.

Finally, waiting for a disaster to happen is a terrible time to practice emergency plans and learn from them. Unfortunately we cannot schedule earthquakes, tsunamis, or fires. We hope that today's webinar gives you an opportunity to broad your perspective of how to plan for large-scaled events and emergency planning. So start thinking now about how planning could be integrated into your next Main Street parade, New Year's Eve, or Fourth of July celebration. This is our challenge from us to you out there.

Our last slide is about thanking you for your attention and for what we hope would be your questions and interest in this program. Our information is listed. We are part of the Mayor's Office on Disability. You can visit our website at [MOD@sfgov.org/mod](mailto:MOD@sfgov.org) for Mayor's Office on Disability. Carla, myself, and really anyone else on our team will be happy to direct you to more information.

With that, thank you.

>> Lewis Kraus: Thank you so much, Carla and Joanna. I think that was really fascinating. I think for everyone, hopefully the connection is very clear here about a way to plan for and get things prepared for your own emergency preparedness and planning in your area. Hopefully the other lesson looked like it took three times, in a way, that you're still finding things along the

way so it's best to actually use these to do your planning ahead of time so you don't have to come up with it on the spot as Joanna pointed out.

So please, all of you out there, please submit your questions in the chat window and we'll get to those right away.

Let's start off the first one. The question is: Since your city is hosting the Super Bowl next year what proactive steps are being taken during this next year to prepare for people with disabilities who will be attending and participating in the latest events?

Let me start by saying the facility that the Super Bowl will be held in is actually not in San Francisco. It's about 50 to 60 miles to the south in a completely different jurisdiction. So I don't know whether Carla and Joanna have anything to say about this. But I'm happy to hear your response if you've got it.

>> Carla Johnson: Thanks, Lewis for that. This is Carla here. You are absolutely right, Lewis. The actual game will be played down south but the celebrations, the fan and player events will all be said here in San Francisco. Our Department of Emergency Management sent a team to Arizona to get a sense of how these large parties play out. The information that they brought back has led us conclude that we need to be in the planning now.

Some of the things that the NFL asks of their host cities are that the city set aside whole blocks and in some cases whole blocks of blocks so that the fans can celebrate openly in the street without worrying about being run over by cars. So anytime that you have these neighborhood restrictions, the first thing that comes to my mind is what happened in New York after 9/11 when security lines were set up allowing only residents to enter certain areas. And those residents actually had supportive service that needed to reach them, too, whether that's meals on wheels or in-home supportive services or paratransit and those issues. So we already can anticipate that these types of party plans could affect people. So we're already starting the conversations about how to make sure that it goes smoothly for those people with disabilities who live and visit here.

>> Lewis Kraus: Great. Thank you. Ok. The next question is -- someone asked: How many ambassadors were there -- you were speaking about the ambassadors.

>> Joanna Fraguli: Hi. This is Joanna. I can take that question. So there were five staff -- basically our entire office was closed down for the day. We started the day at 6:30 in the morning. Plus three folks that we co-opted from the Department of Public Works and headed by our previous Deputy Director for Programmatic Access and two disability access experts from the Department of Public Works. So all in all I think there were eight of us.

>> Lewis Kraus: Ok. The next question says you mentioned 5% of portable toilets must be ADA. Is there a regulation on placement of ADA toilets; for example, must one ADA toilet be required to be near a non-ADA portable toilet?

>> Carla Johnson: That's a really good question. The ADA actually does have those prescriptive standards. And the way that you do the layout is that you have to have 5% of your total are accessible portable toilets and you also have to have that 5% represented within each, you know, each area, each bank and such.

What San Francisco did in 2014 was actually created this large portable toilet area. We asked the vendors to make sure that we had the representation of the accessible portable units basically within each row.

>> Lewis Kraus: Ok. The next question -- pardon me. Since you were providing an elevated platform, one, how did you estimate the number of persons using wheelchairs you would accommodate? And, two, would you consider a temporarily constructed ramp a more reliable recommendation?

>> Carla Johnson: That is definitely one of the lessons learned. We will be pushing for ramps for any of these future events. They don't take up really that much space if you get the layout right. And the added frustration and worry about the mechanical devices I think was too much for all of us to bear. We put a lot of pressure on the event planners around this as well.

Regarding the numbers, those -- the actual size of the platform was set by the party planner. What we had next to the platform was what I would call kind of the overflow area which was a paved area that still had good line of sight because by being up on the plaza you were still seven inches above the people who were seated in the street and the VIP area. So we just kept sort of playing with those places. Some people wanted to be up elevated high. Some people were fine down low. We seemed to do ok on meeting the needs of the people who showed up.

>> Lewis Kraus: And let me --

>> Joanna Fraguli: Actually --

>> Lewis Kraus: Go ahead.

>> Joanna Fraguli: Actually, if I can interject here. There was not a lot of seating provided period, for the event. There were designated seats for VIPs for some Giants' club members and stuff like that. So the actual seating provided and the platform itself was representative of the assembly area's numbers where seating was provided. So we couldn't plan for accommodating 200,000 fans potentially who had disabilities simply because this was not -- seating was not provided for everyone.

>> Lewis Kraus: And let me just add that if your question in general has to do with estimating the number of people with disabilities in a particular area -- this is a little plug for the next webinar which will be delving into that some.

Ok. The next question: First of all, thank you very much for the presentation. I have

one question. How was the selection in preparedness of personnel used to identify needs made?

A second question: How are the learning process taken so far with the planned events in the city been used to plan for unplanned or disaster situations in the city?

>> Carla Johnson: I wonder if we could get a little clarification on the first question about how personnel was selected. If we're talking about the access ambassadors, each individual who served as an access ambassador that day was hand selected by our office; mostly it was our office but then we chose people outside of our office that we knew had a basic fundamental knowledge about disabilities. I'm not sure if we've answered your question with that answer.

Moving on to the second asked. When you have a relationship with all of the different departments, you know, police, fire, human services, health, then they start to think of you even before you tell them that they need to think of you. So as we have these unplanned events, whether the issues may be around occupy or [Indiscernible] matter and such, it is our hope that our partners have learned from the planned events and take those messages back to their interactions for the unplanned.

>> Joanna Fraguli: A quick demonstration of that is several months ago we had some flooding and big storms happening throughout the bay area. So our office actually was invited to participate and to be on call for issues that were going to happen. Of course, the storm didn't end up as being as big as anticipated or have as many damages but we were sort of on hold in trying to work with people who were dependent on power for disability reasons.

>> Carla Johnson: And one last add-on to that, too, is through the Department of Emergency Management and their Emergency Operation Center, one of the things that DEM does is when there is an incident like a storm that Joanna just mentioned or perhaps a fire where people have been displaced, what DEM does is, at minimum, they schedule a conference call. And in the conference call all of us are there. MOD participates so that we're able to get that operating picture and ask the question, using a fire as an example, were there any people with disabilities who were displaced by their fire. What are their housing needs? How are those housing needs being met with the understanding that they may need a higher level of housing, one that's accessible than some of their fellow people? So we all talked together at minimum for response.

>> Joanna Fraguli: And once again, this is not something that happens -- that type of relationships do not get built just as a result of the past three parades or planned events. We are talking about since 2006 our office trying to forcefully insert ourselves into the emergency planning discussions simply because we always thought that emergency planning for people with disabilities was an ADA issue before it became trendy on a national level.

>> Lewis Kraus: Ok. Great.

We have – “As part of the audience here in relation to the Super Bowl question from before, we have a member of the audience who says she was part of the Super Bowl Central Access Committee in Arizona and did work for months to prepare looking over the layout, carefully walking the area to identify areas that needed to be fixed. We walked the first day before opening and were able to quickly identify and fix areas where barricades blocked wheelchair access to the toilets including the accessible ones. A big issue we found was that those who are deaf could not find one contact person to request interpreters. When they did find someone, they got the run-around a bit, were sent on a wild goose chase, etc.”

Though this is not for the group discussion as much, she said that if people want to contact her about that, she's available. I'm going to post her information here on the main board there.

All right. Thank you, Nanette.

Next question. It was stated that the ambassadors for the events were, quote, disability savvy. Can you explain what that disability savvy knowledge looks like; i.e., training over experience, experience over training, etc.?

>> Joanna Fraguli: Actually it means both of those things. It's what I call the cultural sensitivity. Many of us in our office, a majority of us in our office, have some sort of personal experience with a disability. In addition to that, we work around disability access regulations and civil rights issues on a professional level. So it's more than just your average wheelchair user who knows a thing or two about wheelchair access.

Our staff, Disability Access Ambassadors, were actually professionals. They understand both code and they understand reasonable modifications to policies and procedures. They understand the importance of providing communication access. And they're also not afraid to interface with a person with a disability.

It was a curious -- a funny incident. In one of the areas that I was stationed at, there was a woman using a walker. It was a senior. She wanted to get through the VIP area. So I asked her if she had a VIP ticket. She said, “No, but I'm disable. I need a seat so I'm going to get a seat.” I said, I'm really sorry, ma'am, the actual seating non-VIP area states -- my point here is that there were other entry gate staff that could not -- that did not know what to do or how to respond to that individual. That's why I was brought in the conversation of that area. And I was able to very kindly point her to the right section and provide her with an escort to gets to the area she was supposed to be in. So this is what I mean by disability savvy.

>> Lewis Kraus: Great. Thank you.

Another question about in a large gathering with an open wheelchair seating. Will it be required to have companion seating as in stadiums and concert halls?

>> Carla Johnson: Requirements and practical application -- I can just say that we, of course,

allowed the companions and the family members to join the person with the disability in the accessible seating area. So we did accommodate people. We did set a limit.

Actually, Joanna is holding up her finger saying we set a limit for one person per person. But that's not actually how it all played out. As the area filled up, we started to set a limit of one to one. But in the early hours of people who were arriving, there were as many as two, three, and in one case five and six family members that all came to enjoy the celebration together.

>> Joanna Fraguli: However, those five family members were not on the accessible viewing platform. Remember we had a little overflow area. And actually the section was not [Indiscernible] thankfully because of the weather, I think. So we didn't run into that problem.

For constructed assembly areas like concert halls with designated seating, there are regulations, as Carla mentioned, that talk about a maximum of three companions in the vicinity of the accessible seats but definitely one adjacent required under a rule. So when you do plan outdoor events, you don't really -- are not expected to follow those rules to the max. You have to -- feel about the applicability and specifics of the situation.

>> Lewis Kraus: I also want to point out that these types of questions are exactly what you can get an answer for from your regional ADA Center. I'm going to put that number there on the chatroom again, 1-800-949-4232. Carla and Joanna don't have to answer all the ADA-related questions on this session. But you can ask them of the ADA TA people on those lines. That is what they are there for, to give you those kinds of answers. So feel free to call them.

Similarly, we're going to get into another one here in detail. We can either pass that along to the regional centers or not. Steven adds in relation to the previous issue that was discussed. "The 2010 ADA Section 221 for assembly areas over 5,000 calls out 36 plus one for 200. What is the reference to the 5% accessible seating in an assembly referenced earlier?"

>> Carla Johnson: Actually, the 5% number that I used was in the context of accessible portable toilets. It wasn't used in the context of the number of accessible seats.

>> Lewis Kraus: Great. Ok. Thank you.

Another question. Can you explain the reason for the resistance to having the interpreter on the main platform next to the speakers?

>> Carla Johnson: Not very well. [Laughter] I think for those of us that work in the field and have seen the emergence of people fully supporting and embracing having the sign language interpreter right next to the speaker at major events, you know, thinking of Hurricane Sandy and Mayor De Blasio and such. I think that it's just a conversation that we are continuing to push with a lot of passion; that we think that that is the right place so that everybody can see

the interpreter. And certainly the fallback is to have the interpreters visible, at least from the accessible seating area and some other locations. There were multiple sign language interpreters that were hired for this event and they were staged in multiple locations.

>> **Joanna Fraguli:** But, of course, the televised section did not have a sign interpretation as he would have liked. We really wanted them to be on the screen shot to be broadcasted throughout the crowd. But that's a continuing fight. As with everything else, it's about creating a culture. So we will continue to do so.

>> **Lewis Kraus:** It looks like one last comment here. It goes back to Nanette who is pointing out -- embarrassingly, you know, we're pushing a session that we're doing here, but she's mentioning -- reminding me that in Phoenix on April 12 through 14 there will be an ADA conference and they will have two sessions related to venue accessibility, one of which includes a Diamondbacks versus Dodgers and an ADA tour of Chase Field. There's a great list of national and regional experts. People can learn more at this website that I'm posting now. This is for the Phoenix conference if you would like to go to that. There's also one for the Oakland conference if you would like.

All right. That looks to be the end of the questions at the moment. And that's perfect timing because we're coming to the end of our time here.

I just want to remind everybody that you'll receive an e-mail with a link to an online session evaluation. Please complete that evaluation for today's program as we really value your input and want to demonstrate to our funders the impact of what we're putting out there.

I want to thank Carla and Joanna today for sharing their time and knowledge with us. It was really interesting. I thought.

A reminder that today's session was recorded. It will be available for viewing within 72 hours at <http://www.adapresentations.org/archives.php>. You can also get an archive of the webinar by going to the fema.gov website and entering ODIC in the search box.

Thank you for attending today's session. We look forward to seeing you on March 12 for our next webinar, "FEMA Promising Practice Community Maps to Catalyze Partnerships, Planning and Advocacy for Access and Functional Needs."

Have a great rest of your afternoon, everyone.

Bye-bye.